

Long-term Coral Reef Ecological Change
Monitoring Program of the Luis Peña
Channel Marine Fishery Reserve,
Culebra Island, Puerto Rico:

I. Status of the coral reef epibenthic
communities (1997-2002).

Edwin A. Hernández-Delgado*

Department of Natural and Environmental Resources
Coastal Zone Management Program
P.O. Box 9066600
San Juan, Puerto Rico 00906-6600

E-mail:
coral_giac@yahoo.com

*Under contract #2002-000430
U.S. Coral Reef Initiative

November 27, 2002

Table of contents

	Pages
Introduction.	1-3
Methods.	3-11
Study sites.	3-5
Long-term monitoring of coral reef epibenthic communities.	5-8
Multivariate analysis of coral reef communities.	8-9
Indicators of disturbance effects.	9-11
Results.	12-78
Ecological change at CR1.	12-33
Multivariate analysis of coral reef communities at CR1.	34-41
Indicators of disturbance effects at CR1.	42-45
Ecological change at CR1.	45-68
Multivariate analysis of coral reef communities at CR1.	68-74
Indicators of disturbance effects at CR1.	74-78
Discussion.	79-113
Shifts in the structure of coral reef communities.	79-88
<i>Comparison of annual coral decline rates with the wider Caribbean region.</i>	79-81
<i>The role of algae and cyanobacteria on the coral reef phase shifts.</i>	81-86
<i>Detection of shifts in community structure by multivariate analyses.</i>	86-88
Causes of coral decline.	88-107
<i>Caribbean-wide mechanisms or local causes?</i>	88-90
<i>Local factors and their synergism with regional factors.</i>	90-101
<i>White Plague Type II.</i>	90-91
<i>Low herbivory or selective herbivory: The top-down model.</i>	91-96
<i>Interaction among degrading factors: The down-top model.</i>	96-101
<i>A proposed mechanism of coral reef decline.</i>	101-107

Effects on species diversity: Regional vs. local factors, threshold effects, multiple stable states, and Allee effects.	107-113
Conclusions.	113-117
Acknowledgments.	117
Cited literature.	118-129
Appendix	

List of Tables

		Pages
TABLE 1.	Summary of the coral community data at CR1 (1997-2002).	13
TABLE 2.	Summary of the % of relative coral cover at CR1 (1997-2002).	14
TABLE 3.	Friedman 2-way ANOVA for the coral reef community data at CR1.	15
TABLE 4.	Friedman 2-way ANOVA for the % of relative coral cover data at CR1.	16-17
TABLE 5.	Exponential regression analysis between the cumulative coral species richness and the cumulative number of replicate transects at CR1.	19
TABLE 6.	Exponential regression analysis between the cumulative coral species richness and the cumulative colony abundance at CR1.	21
TABLE 7.	Summary of the quadratic regression analysis results between the % of total algal cover and several coral parameters.	33
TABLE 8.	Results of the 2-way crossed ANOSIM test for significant differences of the structure of coral reef epibenthic communities at CR1.	37
TABLE 9.	Results of the pairwise ANOSIM significance test between years at CR1.	37
TABLE 10.	Results of the pairwise ANOSIM significance test between depth zones at CR1.	37
TABLE 11a.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1997 vs 1998 at CR1.	39
TABLE 11b.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1997 vs 1999 at CR1.	39
TABLE 11c.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1997 vs 2001 at CR1.	39
TABLE 11d.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1997 vs 2002 at CR1.	39
TABLE 12a.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1998 vs 1999 at CR1.	40
TABLE 12b.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1998 vs 2001 at CR1.	40

TABLE 12c.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1998 vs 2002 at CR1.	40
TABLE 13a.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1999 vs 2001 at CR1.	41
TABLE 13b.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1999 vs 2002 at CR1.	41
TABLE 14.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 2001 vs 2002 at CR1.	41
TABLE 15.	Summary of the Caswell's neutral model V statistics for CR1.	43
TABLE 16.	Summary of Pearson correlation matrix for different coral species diversity indices at CR1 through time.	43
TABLE 17.	Summary of the coral community data at CR2 (1997-2002).	49
TABLE 18.	Summary of the % of relative coral cover at CR2 (1997-2002).	50
TABLE 19.	Friedman 2-way ANOVA for the coral reef community data at CR2.	51
TABLE 20.	Friedman 2-way ANOVA for the % of relative coral cover data at CR2.	52-53
TABLE 21.	Exponential regression analysis between the cumulative coral species richness and the cumulative number of replicate transects at CR2.	55
TABLE 22.	Exponential regression analysis between the cumulative coral species richness and the cumulative colony abundance at CR2.	57
TABLE 23.	Summary of the quadratic regression analysis results between the % of total algal cover and several coral parameters.	67
TABLE 24.	Results of the 2-way crossed ANOSIM test for significant differences of the structure of coral reef epibenthic communities at CR2.	71
TABLE 25.	Results of the pairwise ANOSIM significance test between years at CR2.	71
TABLE 26.	Results of the pairwise ANOSIM significance test between depth zones at CR2.	71
TABLE 27a.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1997 vs 1998 at CR2.	72
TABLE 27b.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1997 vs 2001 at CR2.	72

TABLE 27c.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1997 vs 2002 at CR2.	72
TABLE 28a.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1998 vs 2001 at CR2.	73
TABLE 28b.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 1998 vs 2002 at CR2.	73
TABLE 29.	Results of the SIMPER analysis of years 2001 vs 2002 at CR2.	73
TABLE 30.	Summary of the Caswell's neutral model V statistics for CR2.	75
TABLE 31.	Summary of Pearson correlation matrix for different coral species diversity indices at CR2 through time.	75

List of Figures

	Pages
FIGURE 1. Benthic habitat map of Culebra Island (modified after NOAA, 2001).	4
FIGURE 2. Change in coral species richness at CR1.	18
FIGURE 3. Change in coral cumulative species richness at CR1.	19
FIGURE 4. Change in coral colony abundance at CR1.	20
FIGURE 5. Relationship among the cumulative coral colony abundance and species richness at CR1.	21
FIGURE 6. Dynamics of the mean colony abundance at CR1 (1997-2002).	22
FIGURE 7. Change in the % of living coral cover at CR1.	23
FIGURE 8. Change in the % of total algal cover at CR1.	24
FIGURE 9. Change in the % of macroalgal cover at CR1.	26
FIGURE 10. Change in the % of filamentous algal cover at CR1.	27
FIGURE 11. Change in the % of cyanobacterial cover at CR1.	28
FIGURE 12. Change in the coral species diversity index at CR1.	30
FIGURE 13. Change in the coral species evenness at CR1.	31
FIGURE 14. Bray-Curtis dissimilarity classification of years (with depth zones as replicates) based on the proportion of coral reef epibenthic categories at CR1.	35
FIGURE 15. MDS-ordination plot of years (with depth zones as replicates) based on the proportion of coral reef epibenthic categories at CR1. Stress level = 0.08.	36
FIGURE 16. K-dominance curve for coral species at CR1.	46
FIGURE 17. Change in coral species richness at CR2.	54
FIGURE 18. Change in coral cumulative species richness at CR2.	55

FIGURE 19.	Change in coral colony abundance at CR2.	56
FIGURE 20.	Relationship among the cumulative coral colony abundance and species richness at CR2.	57
FIGURE 21.	Dynamics of the mean colony abundance at CR2 (1997-2002).	58
FIGURE 22.	Change in the % of living coral cover at CR2.	59
FIGURE 23.	Change in the % of total algal cover at CR2.	60
FIGURE 24.	Change in the % of macroalgal cover at CR2.	61
FIGURE 25.	Change in the % of filamentous algal cover at CR2.	62
FIGURE 26.	Change in the % of cyanobacterial cover at CR2.	63
FIGURE 27.	Change in the coral species diversity index at CR2.	65
FIGURE 28.	Change in the coral species evenness at CR2.	66
FIGURE 29.	Bray-Curtis dissimilarity classification of years (with depth zones as replicates) based on the proportion of coral reef epibenthic categories at CR2.	69
FIGURE 30.	MDS-ordination plot of years (with depth zones as replicates) based on the proportion of coral reef epibenthic categories at CR2. Stress level = 0.04.	70
FIGURE 31.	K-dominance curve for coral species at CR2.	78
FIGURE 32.	White Plague Type II mortality in <i>Montastrea annularis</i> (Ellis & Solander): A) Recent mortality (< 1 week); B) Old mortality (> 1 year).	92
FIGURE 33.	Top-down regulation model of a White-Plague Type II disease outbreak.	102
FIGURE 34.	Top-down regulation model of herbivory by the Long-Spined Sea Urchin, <i>Diadema antillarum</i> .	103
FIGURE 35.	Theoretical predicted interactions among herbivory and long-term eutrophication effects in determining the dominant epibenthic components on shallow coral reefs.	104

FIGURE 36.	Combined top-down and bottom up theoretical mechanisms involved in the recent coral reef decline documented in the LPCMFR.	105
FIGURE 37.	Theoretical predictions of alternate stable states of the LPCMFR coral reefs.	111

Appendix

TABLE A1. Summary of the statistical power of the sampling effort at CR1.

FIGURE A1. Draftman plot of coral species diversity indices at CR1 (1997).

FIGURE A2. Draftman plot of coral species diversity indices at CR1 (1998).

FIGURE A3. Draftman plot of coral species diversity indices at CR1 (1999).

FIGURE A4. Draftman plot of coral species diversity indices at CR1 (2001).

FIGURE A5. Draftman plot of coral species diversity indices at CR1 (2002).

TABLE A2. Summary of the statistical power of the sampling effort at CR2.

FIGURE A6. Draftman plot of coral species diversity indices at CR2 (1997).

FIGURE A7. Draftman plot of coral species diversity indices at CR2 (1998).

FIGURE A8. Draftman plot of coral species diversity indices at CR2 (2001).

FIGURE A9. Draftman plot of coral species diversity indices at CR2 (2002).

TABLE A3. Magnitude of changes in coral reef epibenthic parameters for the period of 1997 to 2002 at CR1 per each depth zone.

TABLE A4. Magnitude of changes in coral reef epibenthic parameters for the period of 1997 to 2002 at CR2 per each depth zone.

TABLE A5. Summary of some examples of rate of changes in the % of coral cover through the Caribbean during the last three decades (modified after Gardner, 2002).

TABLE A6. Coral:algal ratios at CR1.

TABLE A7. Coral:algal ratios at CR2.